*84. [The questioner Shri Janardhana Poojary was absent. For answer *vide* page 27—30 infra.]

Kidney case

*85. SHRI KARNENDU BHATTACHARJEE: Will the Minister of HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE be pleased to state:

(a) whether Government's attention has been drawn to the news-item captioned, "Cop says doctors removed kidney and didn't tell", which appeared in the Hindustan Times, dated the 23'^^ September, 2002;

(b) if so, Government's reaction thereto;

(c) whether any inquiry has been/is being instituted to investigate into the incident;

(d) if so, the details thereof and if not, the reasons therefor; and

(e) whether any action is being contemplated against the concerned doctor{s) for such professional misconduct?

THE MINISTER OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE (SHRI SHATRUGHAN SINHA); (a) to (e) A Statement is laid on the Table of the House.

Statement

(a) to (e) Yes, Sir. A preliminary investigation conducted by the hospital authorities reveals that the patient named Shri Dalbir Singh was operated on 3.5.1999 at Dr. R.M.L. Hospital, New Delhi and as per records, right Pyelolithotomy (removal of kidney stone from Pelvis of right kidney) was done and kidney was not removed as alleged.

Moreover, local police is conducting preliminary investigations on the complaint from Shri Dalbir Singh.

SHRI KARNENDU BHATTACHARJEE: The hon. Minister, in his reply, has stated that the incident which happened on 3.5.1999 is being investigated. He has stated that only a preliminary investigation of the case has been conducted by the hospital authorities, since the year 1999. Sir, it is very unfortunate that a person, who was admitted to a hospital was not informed of the ailments he was suffering from and which surgery was necessary to be performed. Generally the patient and his relatives had to give a written undertaking that they

were agreeable to the operation, without any pre-condition, and that the hospital authorities would not be responsible for any eventuality that may ahse during the course of the surgery. It is clear that even this procedure was not followed in this incident. The hon. Minister has given a casual reply to my question. I would like him to give a specific reply in regard to the incident.

SHRI SHATRUGHAN SINHA: Sir, a preliminary investigation conducted by the hospital authorities reveals that the patient named Shri Dalbir Singh was operated on 3.5.1999. As per the records, right Pyelolithotomy (removal of kidney stone from the Pelvis of the right kidney) was done,'and the kidney was not removed. But, at the same time, the police is also conducting a preliminary investigation. We are awaiting the report. After getting the report, we will act accordingly.

SHRI KARNENDU BHATTACHARJEE: Sir, the hon. Minister has stated that he is awaiting a report on the preliminary investigation. My point is, when the people come to know through the press that such an incident has taken place, the kidney patients, in particular, feel worried. They feel that if such an incident can take place in Delhi, it may happen elsewhere also. Will the hon. Minister, at least, inform the public through his Ministry that no such incident will recur in future. An assurance by him will go a long way in removing this fear.

श्री शत्रुघ्न सिन्हा: सभापति महोदय, माननीय सदस्य ने जो पूछा है, उसके बारे में बता दूं कि हम फिलहाल इस रिपोर्ट का इंतजार कर रहे हैं। लेकिन मैं यह जरूर कहना चाहूंगा कि अगर ऐसी कोई बात हूई या हुई होगी तो यह न सिर्फ निन्दनीय है शर्मनाक है बल्कि बहुत दर्दनाक भी है। ऐसी घटनाएं न हों, इसकी हम न सिर्फ होकथाम करेंगे...(**व्यवधान**)...

श्री लालु प्रसाद: खतरनाक भी है।

श्री शत्रुघ्न सिन्हा: खतरनाक भी है, इसलिए हम सख्त से सख्त कार्रवाई करेंगे। मैं आभार प्रकट करता हूं हमारे मित्र लालू जी का जिन्होंने एक शब्द का इसमें इज़ाफा किया खतरनाक कह कर।

SHRI N.K. PREMACHANDRAN: Sir, I would like to know from the Hon'ble Minister one thing. A big kidney racket is going on throughout the country. We have experienced it in the State of Kerala. There is a kidney racket going on and about 40 cases have already been reported againpt kidney mafia. The Director of Medical Education and the Indian Medical Association, Kerala Branch have conducted an

inquiry and found that there is a nexus between doctors and some agents and politicians. They are working in collusion with kidney transplantation mafia. A litigation to this effect is also going on in a court. So, I would like to know from the hon. Minister whether the Ministry of Health and Family Welfare is aware of these facts. If so, what action has been taken against them?

SHRI SHATRUGHAN SINHA: I appreciate his concern, but the fact remains that firstly, this particular supplementary is not related to this question, and secondly, it is a State subject and it is not proper for me to respond to \/..*(Interruptions)*

MISS MABEL REBELLO: This is going on. How long will it go on?

SHRI N.K. PREMACHANDRAN: How could it be a State subject? It is being governed by an Act passed by the Parliament; and the Act passed by the Parliament cannot be unanswered as it is a State subject.

श्री शत्रुघ्न सिंन्हा: मैं महोदया का गुस्सा समझ सकता हूं। वहां से नाराज होकर कुछ बोल रही हैं। लेकिन मैं उनकी नाराजगी जरूर दुर करूंगा। इस वक्त यही कर सकता हूं कि यह सप्लीमेंट्री जो किया गया है इस पर्टिक्यूलर सवाल से नहीं जूड़ा हुआ है।

श्री सभापति: आप यह भी बता दीजिए कि यह नाराजगी कब दूर करेंगें।

श्री शत्रुघ्न सिन्हा: उनका नाराजगी मैं जल्द दूर करूंगा ...(**व्यवधान**)

कुमारी मैबल रिबैलो**:** ...(व्यवधान) हम लिखकर देंगे। (व्यवधान)

श्री शत्रुघ्न सिन्हा: यह तो आप से ही सीखा है हमने।

Welfare Fund for journalists

*86. SHRI RAJEEV SHUKLA:
DR. ABRAR AHMED:†

Will the Minister of INFORMATION AND BROADCASTING be pleased to state:

(a) whether a Journalists' Welfare Fund for providing *ex-gratia* relief to the journalists exists;

(b) if so, the total amount in this fund, as on date; and

†The question was actually asked on the floor of the House by Dr. Abrar Ahmed.